Editor in Chief
Prof. Irfan YAZICIOGLU (Ph.D), irfan.yazicioglu@hbv.edu.tr
Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University, Faculty of Tourism, Turkey

Editor
Asst. Prof. M. Murat KIZANLIKLI (Ph.D.), murat.kizanlikli@hbv.edu.tr
Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University, Faculty of Tourism, Turkey

Editorial Board

BAKALISH Steve (Ph.D.), steve.bakalis@vu.edu.au
Australian Population and Migration Research Centre, Victoria University, Melbourne, Australia

BOSTAN Ionel (Ph.D.), ionel_bostan@yahoo.com
Dr.HC Stefan cel Mare University of Suceava Romania

EKİNCİ Yüksel (Ph.D.), y.ekinci@henley.ac.uk
The School of Marketing & Reputation, Henley Business School, University of Reading, Whiteknights Campus, Reading, Berkshire, RG6 6UR

GALANOU Aikaterini (Ph.D.), agalanou@teiep.gr
Epirus University of Applied Sciences, School of Management & Economics / Department of Accounting & Finance ,Preveza, Greece

ISLAM Rafikul (Ph.D.), rislam@iium.edu.my
Kulliyyah of Economics and Management Sciences International Islamic University of Malaysia, Malaysia

KUMAR M. Dileep (Ph.D.), dr.dileep.cas@gmail.com
International Teaching University Georgia, Tbilisi, Georgia
OKUMUŞ Fevzi (Ph.D.), fevzi.okumus@ucf.edu
Rosen College of Hospitality Management, The University of Central Florida

PAVLOVİĆ Nebojsa (Ph.D.), racapn@gmail.com
Faculty of Hotel and Tourism, Vrnjacka Banja, University Kragujevac, Serbia

SEGUMPAN Reynaldo Gacho (Ph.D.), segumpan@gmail.com
Department of International Business Administration, College of Applied Sciences – Rustaq Ministry of Higher Education, Rustaq, Sultanate of Oman

SINGH V.K. (Ph.D.), drvksingh1969@gmail.com, drvksingh@gkv.ac.in
Faculty of Management Studies [Fms], Gurukula Kanri Vishwavidyalya Haridwar, Uttarakhand, India

YÜCEL Recai M. (Ph.D.), recaiyucel@mac.com
Albany New York University / USA,

YÜKSEL Sedat (Ph.D.), sedatyuksel@gmail.com
Department of International Business Administration, College of Applied Sciences – Rustaq Ministry of Higher Education, Rustaq, Sultanate of Oman
Contents
2019, Vol: 3, Issue: 7

The Impact of Corporate Visibility on Image and Credibility of Radio Stations in the Kumasi Metropolis
Amoako-Agyeman K. N., Adinkrah, L. K. K. & Eshun, E. F.
pp. 1-16

The Effect Motivation and Job Satisfaction on Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB)
Kartono & Lenie Febriyani
pp. 17-32

An Investigation of Negative Reviews on Tripadvisor about the Seafood Restaurants in Kyrenia
Müjdat Ertürk
pp. 33-45

An Analysis of Factors Influencing Income of Households Producing Lychee Bearing Geographical Indications in Vietnam
Nguyen Quang Hau & Le Thi Yen
pp. 46-56

ISSN: 2602-3385
The Impact of Corporate Visibility on Image and Credibility of Radio Stations in the Kumasi Metropolis

Amoako-Agyeman K. N.  
Department of Communication Design,  
Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology  
kamook22@gmail.com

Adinkrah, L. K. K.  
Angel Broadcast Network  
Kumasi

Eshun, E. F.  
Department of Communication Design,  
Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology  
Kumasi, Ghana

Abstract  
The study focus was to examine audience perception of corporate visibility of radio stations, and its impact on the image and credibility of radio stations in the Kumasi Metropolis, Ghana. Based on quantitative approach, data was collected from 385 respondents (managers of radio stations and radio listeners), and analysed based on both descriptive and inferential statistical tests. The results revealed that most of the radio stations had in place corporate visibility strategies. Though some respondents could not attest to the link between such strategies and visibility, corporate visibility was found to influence corporate image and credibility positively and in a statistically significant relationship. The results suggest a linear dependence of corporate image and credibility on corporate visibility. The implication is that increasing and improving corporate visibility has potential to strengthen corporate image and credibility. Recommendations include the development of customer-oriented service which stresses on good corporate visibility and image-building to influence public perception and choice.

Keywords: Radio station, visibility, credibility, perception
The Impact of Corporate Visibility on Image and Credibility of Radio Stations in the Kumasi Metropolis

Amoako-Agyeman K. N.
Department of Communication Design,
Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology
kamook22@gmail.com

Adinkrah, L. K. K.
Angel Broadcast Network
Kumasi

Eshun, E. F.
Department of Communication Design,
Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology
Kumasi, Ghana

Abstract
The study focus was to examine audience perception of corporate visibility of radio stations, and its impact on the image and credibility of radio stations in the Kumasi Metropolis, Ghana. Based on quantitative approach, data was collected from 385 respondents (managers of radio stations and radio listeners), and analysed based on both descriptive and inferential statistical tests. The results revealed that most of the radio stations had in place corporate visibility strategies. Though some respondents could not attest to the link between such strategies and visibility, corporate visibility was found to influence corporate image and credibility positively and in a statistically significant relationship. The results suggest a linear dependence of corporate image and credibility on corporate visibility. The implication is that increasing and improving corporate visibility has potential to strengthen corporate image and credibility. Recommendations include the development of customer-oriented service which stresses on good corporate visibility and image-building to influence public perception and choice.

Keywords: Radio station, visibility, credibility, perception
1. Introduction

Corporate identity, brand visibility, corporate image and credibility have become core characteristics of today’s organizations in their quest to create a distinguishing character and experience for their target customers and consumers in a pluralistic marketplace. These concepts have become underlying issues for management and scholarly concern over the past decades cutting across various organizational goals and concerns (Kostamo, 2013).

Again, they have become central to academic disciplines like design thinking and communication, strategic management, marketing, communication, public relations and organizational behaviour. Such issues in Marketing are considered core to organizational strategy, credibility, stakeholder support and as tools for gaining a competitive advantage in the business environment as audiences rely on same in making decisions regarding investment, patronage, career and product choice (Melewar, 2003). For firms such as radio stations to deliver their full value to their clients and audiences, scholars opine that issues pertaining to corporate identity, reputation and image as brand visibility need to be acknowledged and well managed just like other strategic resources (Melewar, 2003).

Media practice worldwide has been transformed, taking the role as the fourth realm of power and has a lot of relevance in Ghana, facilitating real time information flow, entertainment and in education on a range of relevant issues. With increasing number of radio stations in Ghana regions, most entrants face challenges about creating unique identity, strong and identifiable brand to remain appealing to majority of listening audience to ensure profitability. Organizational visibility has been identified as an important element of modern business management literature with several scholars hypothesizing its contribution to reducing the degree of asymmetry between managers and other stakeholders (Brammer & Millington, 2006).

Whilst new technologies enable self-expressing of users in real time, establish network ties and develop new relationships, satisfying the needs of traditional electronic media, radio listenership is predicted to run into significant drops in public patronage especially among the youthful class (Yang & Kent, 2014). This new change in technology has disrupted the nature and dynamics of radio practice which demands, that traditional radio firms adapt corporate credibility profiles to meet the
new media environment. This provides a new wave of hope and opportunity for traditional electronic media to survive and create value for themselves and their stakeholders. Indeed, existing research on identity building and management of media brands is largely biased towards the consumers’ personal identities and attributes rather than that of the organizations (Hollenbeck & Kaikati, 2012; Bargh et al., 2002).

Abd-El-Salam et al. (2013) equated corporate image to brand credibility whilst Nguyen (2006) considers corporate image as an important factor in evaluating firm credibility, seen as an outcome of a customer’s mental perception and impression about a brand. Zaim et al., (2010) reveal, that corporate image has a great influence on satisfaction and institutional credibility. A favourable firm image was found to be crucial for a firm’s ability to maintain its position in the market and carve for itself, a strong reputation leading to improved customer retention and loyalty (Nguyen & Leblanc, 2001). Source expertise and trustworthiness were seen as the primary considerations for a credible information source (Houdek, 2017). Shaw (2011) asserts that, organizations seeking success need to acquire a thorough knowledge of the current and potential markets for its products and services, and position itself in the minds of customers and consumers. Today’s competitive marketplace demands the development of a strong and positive corporate visibility strategy towards attaining and sustaining a lasting competitive advantage (Arslan & Altuna, 2010; Birtwistle & Shearer, 2001).

Corporate visual identity (CVI) encompasses visual (tangible) elements such as the entity’s logo, colour palette, typefaces (fonts), layout, photography and illustrations, advertising styles and even signs and symbols (Van den Bosch et al, 2005) and is used by companies, to project their quality, style and prestige to all their stakeholders, hence form an integral part of corporate identity (Melewar & Saunders, 1999). It is a needed corporate expenditure for any organization’s survival and existence and as such, firms that do not have the required capital to support such an investment may suffer the consequence that comes with it (Alshebil, 2007). Christensen and Askegaard (2001) found that CVI, besides differentiating firms from each other, has a positive effect on the sales and stakeholder recognition of firms.

In the last century, a large number of scholars and organizations have taken key interest in the multidimensional foundations of business identity (Balmar, 2001), seen in two spectacles, through the lenses of national culture and academic disciplines. Besides, researchers have broken down the
concept of business identity into corporate identity, organizational identity and visual identity (Balmar, 2001). Corporate identity is an integrity concept through which organizations reveal their philosophy, conception, communication and behaviour for the purpose of distinguishing themselves from rivals (Karadeniz, 2009); the visual manifestation of a firm’s reality conveyed through its name, logo, motto, colours, products, services, and other tangible evidences created by the organization and communicated (Argenti, 2015).

Asamoah-Gyadu (2008) emphasises, that the state of media plurality in Ghana places great demand on owners and managers of firms to continue to find new (ethical) ways of getting the masses to be loyal. The National Communication Authority (2016) puts authorized radio stations in Ghana at 481; Ashanti Region has 63 but only 46 are in operation with 36 in the Kumasi Metropolis. A cursory visitation to some radio stations reveals low or no presence of deliberate and proper corporate visibility strategy. For some, there are virtually little or no signage, that identify the radio station in the building they operate from to give directions. Similarly, there are also little or no uniquely distinctive features that differentiate each radio station from the other apart from basic signboards that contain the name of the station, assigned frequency and logo. The media landscape is not immune to rivalry and competition, therefore improved service and effective branding must complement adequate preparation and programming to ensure profitability (Asamoah-Gyadu, 2008) and continued patronage.

The concept, however, is not widely researched in the field of business and visual communication (Bartholmé & Melewar, 2011). Van den Bosch et al., (2006) emphasized that CVI, is a field, that has received little attention in research hence, advocate for organizations to dedicate special attention to this endeavour which borders on issues of brand bonding, loyalty and credibility to ensure consistency. The aim of the research was to examine audience perception about corporate visibility of radio stations, and how it impacts on their image and credibility in the Kumasi Metropolis. Considering the concept relationships separately, the following hypotheses were tested:

**H1:** There is a statistically significant relationship between corporate visibility and corporate image among radio stations in the Kumasi Metropolis.
**H2**: There is a statistically significant relationship between corporate visibility and radio station’s credibility in the Kumasi Metropolis.

2. **Method**

The quantitative approach was utilized in the collection of data based on self-administered questionnaire in a survey. The population of the Kumasi Metropolis (KMA), for the study is estimated about 1,730,249 in 2015 (Metropolitan Authority, www.kma.gov.gh) and the approximate radio listenerhip population of 83,000 at peak time (National Communications Authority (NCA, 2016). Based on random sampling technique the instrument was distributed to managers of radio stations and radio listeners. This technique chosen, due to its suitability for cases that are particularly informative, make enumerating larger populations, possible (Morse and Niehaus, 2009). This study sampled 385 radio listeners and managers of the major radio stations within the KMA, after seeking their consent and assuring confidentiality.

3. **Results and Discussion**

The results were analyzed, generating descriptive statistics and inferential analyses. Table 1 details the sample characteristics.

**Table 1 Sample characteristics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>52.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>47.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>45.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25-31</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>37.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>32-38</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>39-45</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46 and above</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational background</td>
<td>Basic</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tertiary</td>
<td>345</td>
<td>89.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred radio station (FM)</td>
<td>Luv</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Focus</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>15.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nhyira</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Silver</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The study involved 385 respondents who filled the questionnaire of which 52.25% were males and 47.8% were females. Majority (83.2) of respondents ranged between 18 and 31 whilst a huge majority has tertiary education (89.6%). It is not surprising therefore that majority (41.6) preferred the first two radio stations which mostly broadcast in English and close to a major University.

On respondents’ view on their preferred Radio Station’s Corporate Image (Table 2), majority (76.7%), at least agreed, that the station offers high quality services to its audience and partners with 85.2% at least agreeing to a much better service. Majority of respondents (47.5%), at least disagrees with 36.4% unsure of programmes and activities appealing to people across every social class and age category.

On whether the station has a wider geographic coverage than most, majority were not sure (52.2%) and those who agreed were 40.8%. Also, majority (47.5%) agreed that the station's programmes and activities appeal to people across every social class and age category whilst 36.4% were not sure. Majority of respondents (66.5%), at least agreed, that the management and staff are very effective and real with people's concerns, whiles only 38.9% at least agreed that they make listening to radio very practical, experiential and exciting.

**Table 2 Radio Station’s Corporate Image**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Not Sure</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The station offers high quality services to its audience and partners</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>23.4</td>
<td>62.3</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. It provides a much better service to her target audience</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>74.8</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. It has a wider geographic coverage than most</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>52.2</td>
<td>40.8</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The station’s programs and activities appeal to people across every social class and age category</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>47.5</td>
<td>36.4</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
On respondents’ perception about preferred Radio Station’s Credibility (Table 3), firstly, less than half (42.3%) at least agreed that it has staff who possess a great amount of media experience whilst 46.2% were not sure. Secondly, majority of respondents (70.9%) at least agreed that the station demonstrates honesty, integrity and professionalism. Thirdly, many respondents (59.7%) were not sure that it demonstrates consistent corporate behaviour internally and externally. Furthermore, 48.3% and 44.2% of respondents were not sure and at least agreed respectively, that it has an appreciable level of expertise in the media industry. More so, 49.4% at least agreed whilst 41.8% were not sure respectively, that they trust the content of programmes, the staff and information received from their favourite radio station. Majority of respondents (54.3%) agreed that it is supportive of lawfulness, ethics and governance. Also, majority of respondents (43.9%) agreed that the station is quick to apologize and withdraw any bad information churned out once they notice it to be untrue, whiles also majority (61%) were not sure that it demonstrates social and environmental responsibility.

Table 3 Radio Station’s Credibility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Not Sure</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. It has staff who possess a great amount of media experience.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>46.2</td>
<td>37.1</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The station demonstrates honesty, integrity and professionalism</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>57.4</td>
<td>13.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. It demonstrates consistent corporate behaviour internally and externally</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>59.7</td>
<td>25.2</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. It has an appreciable level of expertise in the media industry</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>48.3</td>
<td>42.1</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. I trust the content of programs, the staff and information received from my favourite radio station.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>41.8</td>
<td>43.4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. It is supportive of lawfulness, ethics and governance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>CV (in %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. The station is quick to apologize and withdraw any bad information churned out once they notice it to be untrue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>CV (in %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>33.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43.9</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. It demonstrates social and environmental responsibility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>CV (in %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.5</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To measure the audience’s perception of the radio stations’ corporate visibility initiatives, the respondents were required to state the extent to which they agreed with or otherwise to a number of statements regarding corporate visibility. The result of this analysis is summarized in Table 4 below (where ‘CV’ is the coefficient of variation and ‘SD’ is the standard deviation.

### Table 4 Audience Perception about Radio Stations’ Corporate Visibility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Corporate Visibility Scale</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>CV (in %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The location is strategic and convenient for the public to reach them easily.</td>
<td>3.52</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>19.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The image and reputation is an important influence on people’s choices.</td>
<td>3.54</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>16.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Ownership and management structure attracts people to it.</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>14.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Its vision and mission statement guides the direction and strategy of the firm.</td>
<td>3.55</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>17.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Its Mission is operationalized through program goals and activities.</td>
<td>3.36</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. History of performance influences people’s patronage.</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>15.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The external affiliation with other sister stations makes me wants to listen to them always.</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The location enables better service delivery to the public.</td>
<td>3.25</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>20.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. The staff, buildings, events, cars, etc. are modern and attractive.</td>
<td>3.47</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>19.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. It has adequate equipment and facilities.</td>
<td>3.33</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. The programs and events are relevant and people-oriented.</td>
<td>3.62</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>20.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. It allows for public inputs and takes these public opinions to serious consideration.</td>
<td>3.93</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>19.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. It allows for regular communication and interaction with the public which makes each other feel appreciated.</td>
<td>3.88</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>15.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
14. It has a well-managed and updated website and social media platform.  
15. The colours appeal to me.  
16. The logo does not appeal to me.  
17. The branding of the station appeals to me.  
18. Their tag line or slogan appeals to me.  
19. The corporate image is enhanced by excellent customer relationship.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
<th>Variance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14. It has a well-managed and updated website and social media platform.</td>
<td>3.88</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>18.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. The colours appeal to me.</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>15.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. The logo does not appeal to me.</td>
<td>3.67</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>19.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. The branding of the station appeals to me.</td>
<td>3.76</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>14.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Their tag line or slogan appeals to me.</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>17.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. The corporate image is enhanced by excellent customer relationship.</td>
<td>3.63</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>18.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Grand Mean Score**  

| Grand Mean Score | 3.69 | 0.655 | 17.9 |

The grand mean score rating of 3.69 in Table 4 indicates to a larger extent, an agreement on the part of respondents on the existence of corporate visibility practices among the surveyed radio firms. The two questions on public interaction and regular updates on their website with good social media presence (items 13 and 14) each produced the highest mean score value of 3.88 while the item (item 6) on the history of performance influencing people’s patronage yielded the lowest mean value of 3.05.

Consequently, the highest variability in response was on (item 8) the location of these firms enabling better service delivery to the public; which yielded a coefficient of variation (CV) of 20.5. This implies that, the responses given by the sampled population were generally positive, consistent and in agreement with each other. This is an indication of the public’s positive verdict on the surveyed firms’ corporate visibility strategies. Invariably, the pay-offs from good corporate visibility from literature cannot be over-emphasized as literature abundantly demonstrates that, positive corporate visibility eventually leads to some positive outcomes including good market positioning (Shaw, 2011), lasting competitive advantage (Arslan & Altuna, 2010; Birtwistle & Shearer, 2006) and leaves behind a good impression of quality on the minds of customers (Keller, 2003; Zamardino & Goodfellow, 2007). Keller (1993) argued that there is a positive relationship between corporate visibility and consumer loyalty.

The simple frequency analysis conducted reveals, that there is some good level of public awareness of the visibility drive that these radio stations are embarking on as there is evidence of agreement among the respondents of good corporate visibility by these firms.
Effects of Corporate Visibility on Radio Stations’ Image

A test for the relationship between corporate visibility and firm image based on the hypothesis:

**H1**: There is a statistically significant relationship between corporate visibility and corporate image among radio stations in the Kumasi Metropolis.

The result of the analysis is summarized in Table 5:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R Score</th>
<th>R-Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Standard Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.694</td>
<td>.435</td>
<td>.443</td>
<td>.04387</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Overall Significance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F-test</th>
<th>Sig. (p-value)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Regression</td>
<td>0.058</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>28.274</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>0.063</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>0.132</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Composite Score Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coeff.</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>T-Test</th>
<th>Sig. (p-value)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (Constant)</td>
<td>0.355</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>5.152</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Visibility</td>
<td>0.513</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>5.322</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Predictors: (Constant), Corporate Visibility; Dependent Variable: Corporate Image

Table 5 shows that, corporate visibility has some statistically significant influence on corporate image as the test indicates, that corporate visibility explains 43.5% of the variation in corporate image ($R^2=0.435$). The standardized regression coefficient ($\beta$) value of the computed (composite index) scores of corporate visibility was 0.655 with a t-test score of 5.322 and a significance level of $p=0.000$.

The results also show a linear dependence of corporate image on corporate visibility.

The regression equation of this result thus:

$CV = \beta_0 + \beta_1X$
CV = 0.355 + 0.655 CI

Where CV=corporate visibility, β₀=constant and CI=corporate image.

This finding agrees with previous studies which found a positive relationship between corporate visibility and corporate image (Olins 2000; Lewis 2000; Pauvit 2000; Balmer 2001, Balmer and Greyser 2003). Efforts aimed at enhancing corporate visibility correlate statistically and significantly with a positive corporate image improvement. Therefore, the hypothesis that there is a statistically significant relationship between corporate visibility and corporate image among radio stations in the Kumasi Metropolis is supported by the current study.

In determining the relationship between corporate visibility and firm image, the results of the regression analysis show that, there is a statistically significant relationship between the two variables. As literature on corporate image suggests, firm performance is influenced by the feelings, attachment and beliefs people have in their minds about an organization. Therefore, managing corporate image involves a fabrication and projection of a desired picture of the organization; deliberately constructed to influence the public (Olins 2000, Lewis 2000, Pauvit 2000, Balmer 2001, Balmer and Greyser 2003). The study reveals 68% of respondent perceived emotionally attached to the image of the radio stations and would readily patronize their events and programmes. Notwithstanding, a sizable number (40%) are quite sceptical about the future prospects and growth of these radio stations.

**Effects of Corporate Visibility on Radio Stations’ Credibility**

To assess the influence of corporate visibility on firm credibility, a regression analysis was conducted with a relevant hypothesis formulated as follows:

**H2:** There is a statistically significant relationship between corporate visibility and radio station’s credibility in the Kumasi Metropolis.

The result from the regression analysis to test this relationship is summarized in Table 6:
Table 6 Effects of Corporate Visibility on Radio Stations’ Credibility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goodness of Fit</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>R Score</td>
<td>R-Square</td>
<td>Adjusted R Square</td>
<td>Standard Error of the Estimate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.342</td>
<td>0.144</td>
<td>0.114</td>
<td>0.05624</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Significance</th>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F-test</th>
<th>Sig. (p-value)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>0.016</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>5.538</td>
<td>0.022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>0.111</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>0.131</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composite Score Test</th>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coeffic.</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>T-Test</th>
<th>Sig. (p-value)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>0.551</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>6.495</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Corporate Visibility</td>
<td>0.211</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>2.436</td>
<td>0.025</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Predictors: (Constant). Corporate Visibility; Dependent Variable: Corporate Credibility

Form the results, corporate visibility explains 14.4% of the variability in corporate credibility of radio stations in the Kumasi Metropolis; which is statistically significant ($R^2=0.144$). It yielded a standardized regression coefficient ($\beta$) value of corporate visibility at 0.342 with a t-test value of 2.436 which is significant at $p=0.025$. The results suggest a linear dependence of corporate image on corporate visibility, supported by earlier findings (Nguyen & Leblanc, 2001; Zaim et al., 2010). Thus far, the hypothesis that there is a statistically significant relationship between corporate visibility and radio station’s credibility in the Kumasi Metropolis is supported by this study. This is summarized by the regression equation:

$$CV = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X$$

$$CV = 0.551 + 0.322 CC$$

Where $CV$=corporate visibility, $\beta_0$=constant and CI=corporate credibility.
4. Conclusion

Corporate visibility was found to influence corporate image and credibility in a positive and statistically significant relationship of radio stations in Kumasi. About 71% affirm that stations demonstrate honesty, integrity and professionalism. The statistically significant relationship is reflective of other findings (Nguyen & Leblanc, 2001; Zaim et al., 2010). The results show that a firm’s corporate visibility is partly dependent on its location, physical structure, leadership and management approach as well as quality and competence of employees. The implication is that, increasing corporate visibility could strengthen corporate image and credibility.

5. Suggestions

Radio stations are expected to play a vital role in information dissemination, public education and entertainment. The media contributes in improving public awareness and participation in socio-economic issues. It should be a hub for continuous research, public education and scrutiny to inform policies about media practice in Ghana. To this end, management should ensure and maintain acceptable physical presence that appeals to the public and integrate innovativeness in their operations to influence public perception and choice.

6. Acknowledgement

The authors wish to thank the study participants for their valuable contributions to this work.

7. References


The Effect Motivation and Job Satisfaction on Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB)

Kartono

Department Of Management, Faculty Of Economics, Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati, Cirebon City, West Java, Indonesia

kartono.unswagati@gmail.com

Lenie Febriyani

Department of Management, Faculty of Economics, Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati, Cirebon City, West Java, Indonesia

Abstract

This research is intended to study the influence of; motivation on organizational citizenship; job satisfaction on organizational citizenship behavior; and motivation and job satisfaction (simultaneously) on organizational citizenship behavior of the employees. The method used in this research is associative research aiming to identify the causal relationship between the independent and dependent variable. Data collection techniques used in this research are field study using questionnaire and literature study. The population in this research consists of 58 employees, and the sample was determined using a saturated sample technique. The result of this research shows that motivation has a significant effect on organizational citizenship behavior with a significance value of 0.000 < 0.05. Job satisfaction significantly affects organizational citizenship behavior with a significance value of 0.000 < 0.05. Motivation and job satisfaction simultaneously have a significant effect on organizational citizenship behavior with a significance value of 0.000 < 0.05. The extent of the influence of motivation and job satisfaction on organizational citizenship behavior is 45.8%. It indicates that the rest (44.2%) is influenced by other variables not examined in this research.

Keywords: Motivation; Job Satisfaction, Organizational Citizenship Behavior
The Effect Motivation and Job Satisfaction on Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB)

Kartono
Department Of Management, Faculty Of Economics, Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati, Cirebon City, West Java, Indonesia
kartono.unswagati@gmail.com

Lenie Febriyani
Department of Management, Faculty of Economics, Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati, Cirebon City, West Java, Indonesia

Abstract
This research is intended to study the influence of; motivation on organizational citizenship; job satisfaction on organizational citizenship behavior; and motivation and job satisfaction (simultaneously) on organizational citizenship behavior of the employees. The method used in this research is associative research aiming to identify the causal relationship between the independent and dependent variable. Data collection techniques used in this research are field study using questionnaire and literature study. The population in this research consists of 58 employees, and the sample was determined using a saturated sample technique. The result of this research shows that motivation has a significant effect on organizational citizenship behavior with a significance value of 0.000 < 0.05. Job satisfaction significantly affects organizational citizenship behavior with a significance value of 0.000 < 0.05. Motivation and job satisfaction simultaneously have a significant effect on organizational citizenship behavior with a significance value of 0.000 < 0.05. The extent of the influence of motivation and job satisfaction on organizational citizenship behavior is 45.8%. It indicates that the rest (44.2%) is influenced by other variables not examined in this research

Keywords: Motivation; Job Satisfaction, Organizational Citizenship Behavior
1. Introduction

In this globalization era, business competition is getting tighter. Companies must be able to keep up with the current development in order to compete with their competitors. In order to compete, companies must focus on paying attention to their human resources. Good human resources are valuable assets and capital owned by the company because human resources drive the companies to develop, survive, and improve in advancing the company to achieve their organizational goals. Human resources with a maximum contribution to the company will support the attainment of companies’ goals.

Good human resources can be seen from their citizenship behavior to the organization. The organizational citizenship behavior is freedom of behavior to determine something that is not part of the formal requirements of the work but contributes to the psychological and social environment of the workplace (Robbins and Judge, 2017: 46). Employees with organizational citizenship behavior will significantly benefit the company in maintaining organizational stability and functions.

Organizational citizenship behavior is not so familiar in the business of Indonesia’s context. Nonetheless, many employees in Indonesia show organizational citizenship behavior by contributing more to organizations beyond their written responsibilities as employees. This behavior can be reflected in several examples, namely, willing to work overtime without asking for more rewards if the company has important activities outside of the formal responsibilities of workers, carrying out unsolicited tasks, helping coworkers in solving problems, helping new employees to adapt in the work environment, trying not to complain and swear at any situation, participating in the event organized by the company, taking extra responsibility voluntarily, coming on time, emphasizing details and quality of the task, and generally working above the call of duty.

To nurture and improve organizational citizenship behavior, the company can increase the work motivation of the employees. Motivation is something that increases encouragement to work (Sedarmayanti, 2017: 154). Motivated employees will be more enthusiastic and strive to carry out their duties and responsibilities. Motivation can encourage employees to work harder so they can achieve their goals. One of the sources of motivation is the pride of being a part of the company. This sense of pride will bring positive encouragement to the employees so their productivity will be better (Rivai et al., 2015: 608).
In addition to motivation, job satisfaction is also closely related to the quality of human resources that can streamline an organization. Satisfaction is an evaluation that describes a person with a feeling of being happy or unhappy, and satisfied or not satisfied at work (Rivai et al., 2015: 620). The organizations which have many satisfied workers tend to be more effective than organizations which have fewer satisfied workers (Robbins and Judge, 2017: 46). Employees who feel satisfied with the company they are working for will speak positively about it, talk to the company when facing external criticism, and trust the company as well as its management that they do the right things. The employees who feel satisfied tend to be involved in organizational behavior, work outside of their job description and help other members in reducing workload and stress level (Kartono, Mahadianto, dan Mardi, 2015).

PT. JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. also expects its employees to show more performance in order the company to survive and be renowned as an excellent company offering toll road service as stated in its vision and mission. To align organizational goals and individual goal of employees in achieving the vision and mission of the company, PT. JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. conducts employee satisfaction survey regularly so the company can receive direct feedback from employees. Through this survey, the company expects each employee to convey views on various aspects that determine the level of job satisfaction and can submit suggestions and input to the management regarding matters that can improve employee satisfaction and productivity. Figure 1 shows the result of Engagement Ratio Index (ERI) conducted by PT. JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. in the last four years (2013-2016).

![Figure 1. Engagement Ratio Index Employee PT. JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Years 2013 – 2016](image)

*Figure 1. Engagement Ratio Index Employee PT. JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Years 2013 – 2016*

*Source: Sustainability Report PT. JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk*
Engagement Ratio Index (ERI) is the result of employee satisfaction survey indicating attachment, satisfaction, and enthusiasm of employees to their jobs. Based on Figure 1, it shows that the ERI chart has fluctuated over the past four years. So, it can be identified that organizational citizenship behavior at PT. JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. was still low, caused by less optimal employee motivation and job satisfaction.

Some research shows that organizational citizenship behavior is influenced by motivation and job satisfaction of employees. Job satisfaction is moderately correlated with OCB; people who are more satisfied with their jobs are more likely to be involved in OCB (Robbins and Judge, 2017: 53). This notion is in line with the research of Yuliati (2016) indicating that job satisfaction has a positive and significant effect on organizational citizenship behavior. That research used five dimensions in measuring OCB variable, namely altruism, courtesy, civic virtue, conscientiousness, and sportsmanship.

Another research shows a different result from the previous research. Vania and Purba (2014) indicate that job satisfaction variable partially does not have a significant effect on organizational citizenship behavior. Their research used four dimensions of Moorman and Brakley for measuring OCB variable, namely, personal industry, interpersonal helping, individual initiative, and loyal boosterism.

Based on the phenomenon explained earlier, we are motivated to study the Organizational Citizenship Behavior among the employees of PT. JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon.

This research aims to; 1) identify and analyze the effect of motivation on organizational citizenship behavior, 2) identify and analyze the effect of job satisfaction on organizational citizenship behavior, and 3) identify and analyze the simultaneous effect of motivation and job satisfaction on organizational citizenship behavior of the employees.

2. Literature review and hypotheses

2.1. Motivation

According to Rivai et al., (2015, 607) “motivation is a series of behavior and values affecting individual to attain specific things in line with his life’s goals.” Motivation means giving the driving force which can create enthusiasm to the people so they can cooperate, work effectively, and be integrated with all their efforts to achieve satisfaction (Hasibuan, 2013, 143). While Robbins and Judge (Robbins & Judge, 2017) argued that motivation is a willingness to make
maximum efforts towards organizational goals, conditioned by the ability of those efforts to meet individual needs. Thus, it can be concluded that motivation is a series of attitudes, willingness, high values and drivers that exist within a person to influence, encourage, move and excite individuals so that they are willing to work together effectively, integrated with all efforts to achieve goals and satisfaction as well as to meet individual needs.

Meanwhile, Osman et al., (2015) stated that “motivation is the real effort and energy of employees included in their daily work to complete tasks or jobs.”

Motivation is defined by Khadija et al., (2014) as a process of giving direction to the individuals in achieving goals. Meanwhile, Bessel et al., (2015) explained that motivation is an essential tool used by a manager at a workplace to inspire people to work both individually and in a group to produce the best results for the company effectively and efficiently.

Thus, based on those three opinions, it can be concluded that motivation is the process of real effort and energy of the employees which are put into work to provide direction to individuals in achieving their goals. Managers use motivation as a tool to direct employees to produce the best results for business most efficiently and effectively.

Many experts and psychologists have suggested the dimensions of the motivational variable. According to the Theory of Needs put forward by McClelland (1973), there are three needs of human which are crucial in an organization (Rivai et al., 2015: 610), namely:

1. **Need for achievement.** It is the need to achieve success, the ability to achieve something predetermined by the company’s standards, and employees’ struggle to succeed.
2. **Need for power.** It is the need for power or work authorization and the need to make people behave reasonably and wisely in conducting their duties.
3. **Need for affiliation.** It is the need or desire to be friends and get to know more about coworkers or employees in the organization.

### 2.2. Job satisfaction

According to Mangkunegara(2016, p. 117), job satisfaction is a feeling which supports or does not support an employee related to his work or other conditions. Hasibuan(Hasibuan, 2013) explained that job satisfaction is an emotional behavior in loving and liking the job. Meanwhile, Sinambela(2017, p. 301) defined that job satisfaction is a set of employees’ feelings about whether or not their job is pleasant.

Based on those three definitions, it can be concluded that job satisfaction is a set of feelings and
emotional behavior that arise in the employees describing a pleasant or not pleasant feeling related to their job or condition.

While Kartono, Mahardianto, and Mardi (Kartono et al., 2015) defined job satisfaction as a situation where emotion and positive condition are held by job evaluation or work experience of somebody. Job satisfaction is defined by Osman et al. (Osman et al., 2015) as a general reaction owned by somebody to a particular job. Traditionally, job satisfaction relates to coworkers, salary, working condition, job supervision, and benefits. Whereas, Mohammad, Habib, and Alias (2011) defined job satisfaction as pleasure from a positive emotional state resulted from an assessment of work experience of someone. Based on those explanations, it can be concluded that job satisfaction is a situation where emotions and positive general reactions resulted from the assessment of work and experience possessed by someone to a particular job.

Some experts have pointed out the dimensions of job satisfaction variable. Herzberg (1964) in the Two Factor Theory enlightened that there are two factors which may affect satisfaction or dissatisfaction, namely (Syptak et al., 2018):

1. Hygiene Issue (dissatisfiers). This issue relates to the inability to motivate employees, but the company still can minimize dissatisfaction if it is managed correctly. In other words, employees will feel dissatisfied if they are not appropriately treated. Hygiene issue includes the firm policies, supervision, salary, interpersonal relationship, and working condition. These are the issues related to the environment of the employees.

2. Motivators (satisfiers). Motivators create satisfaction by fulfilling individual needs for meaning and personal growth. Motivators include achievement, recognition, the job itself, responsibility and improvement.

2.3. Organizational citizenship behavior (OCB)

(Robbins & Judge, 2017) defined Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) as freedom in behavior for determining something which is not part of the formal requirement of an employee but it has a contribution to the psychological and social environment of a workplace. (Dyne, Graham, & Dienesch, 1994) defined OCB as a conceptualization of a global concept that includes all positive organizational behavior from individuals/members of the organization.

Whereas, (Organ, Podsakoff, & MacKenzie, 2006) defined OCB as freedom of individual behavior which is indirectly or explicitly recognized by the formal reward system, and contributes to the
effectiveness and efficiency of organizational functions.

Based on the explanations above, it can be concluded that OCB is freedom of behavior and positive actions carried out voluntarily by individuals in an organization. These behavior and positive actions are outside the requirement of formal work that can contribute to the psychological, social, effectiveness and efficiency of organizational functions. Whereas, Islam et al., (2014) asserted that OCB is a concept which describes the voluntary commitment of a person in an organization or company that is not part of his contractual duties.

Riantini and Iriawan (2016) defined OCB as the individual contribution which exceeds the requirement of his job, and his performance is rewarded by the completion of the job. Other researchers, Jahangir, Akbar, and Haq (2004) defined OCB as a work behavior that exceeds the basic needs of a worker.

Based on the above explanation it can be concluded that OCB is work behavior and the contribution that describes voluntary commitment of somebody to the organization or company. This commitment exceeds the requirement and not part of his conceptual tasks. He is rewarded by the completion of the task performance.

Some researchers differ in opinion about the dimensions of OCB. Bateman and Organ introduced “Organizational Citizenship Behavior” in 1983. In 1983, Smith, Organ and Near analyzed 16 OCB measurements and resulted in two factors, namely altruism, and conscientiousness. Subsequently, Organ developed those two factors to be five model factors in five dimensions, namely: altruism, courtesy, conscientiousness, sportsmanship, and civic virtue. In 1991, William and Anderson developed OCB in the behavioral target, dividing the dimension of OCB construct to be two dimensions, namely OCBI and OCBO.

Van Dyne, Graham and Dienesh (1994) had a different point of view proposing the dimensions of obedience, loyalty, and participation. Moorman and Blakely (1995) revealed four dimensions of OCB which were the mixed between OCB based on Graham (1998) and Organ et al. (2006). These four dimensions of OCB are personal industry, interpersonal helping, individual initiative, and loyal boosterism.

Williams and Anderson (1991) proposed two dimensions of OCB as follows (Mohammad, Habib, and Alias, 2011):

1. Citizenship behaviors directed toward individuals (OCB-I). OCBI refers to behaviors that benefit certain individuals in an organization and, thus, contribute indirectly to
organizational effectiveness. OCBI is behavior directed at particular individuals in the organization, such as courtesy and altruism.

2. Citizenship behaviors directed towards the organization (OCB-O). OCBO includes behaviors which benefit organizations without actions explicitly aimed at the members of the organization. OCBO is behavior that is related to the benefits of the organization as a whole, such as conscientiousness, sportsmanship, and civic virtue.

2.4. Research hypothesis

Based on the explanation outlined earlier, the hypotheses in this research are formulated as follows:

H1: Motivation ($X_1$) affects Organizational Citizenship Behavior ($Y$) of employees.

H2: Job satisfaction ($X_2$) affects Organizational Citizenship Behavior ($Y$) of employees.

H3: Motivation ($X_1$) and Job satisfaction ($X_2$) affect Organizational Citizenship Behavior ($Y$) of employees.

3. Methods

This study uses an associative method of causal relationship because this study aims to determine the causal relationship between the independent variables (influencing variables) and the dependent variable (the affected variables). Associative research is research which aims to find out the relationship between two or more variables. This type of study has a higher quality when compared to the descriptive and comparative research. This research is expected to build a theory for explaining, forecasting, and controlling specific phenomenon (Sugiyono, 2017: 11).

We used a Likert scale in measuring the variables consisting of strongly agree (5), agree (4), neuter (3), disagree (2), and strongly disagree (1). Likert scale allows the set variables to be explained in more detail as the indicator of the variable. Then, the indicator of the variable is used as a keyword in compiling a question or statement that will be used in making a research questionnaire.

The population in this study consisted of employees of PT. JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon totaling to 58 employees. The sampling technique used is saturated sampling in determining the members of the population that will be used as a sample.

Data collection techniques are the ways used to collect data and other information related to the research problems which become the object of the research. The sources and data collection
techniques used in this study are interviews, questionnaires, and observations. Regression analysis was conducted to determine whether there was a relationship or not between the independent variables (motivation and job satisfaction) and the dependent variable (organizational citizenship behavior). Multiple regression analysis is commonly used to measure the effect of the linear relationship between two or more independent variables with the dependent variable.

4. Results and discussion

4.1. Characteristic of respondents based on gender

Employee characteristic based on the gender of PT JasaMarga (persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon is shown in figure 2.

Figure 2 shows that respondents in this research are mostly men consisting of 44 people or 76% of the total employees. The rest is female respondents consisting of 14 women or 24%.

4.2. Characteristic of respondents based on age

Employee characteristic based on the age of PT JasaMarga (persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon is shown in table 1.

Table 1. Characteristics of Age-Based Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Number of</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>less than 25 yrs</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>25 – 35 yrs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>36 – 45 yrs</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>36.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>more than 45 yrs</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>53.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3. Characteristic of respondents based on education

Employee characteristic based on education of PT JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon is shown in figure 3.

Figure 3 shows that the respondents participating in this study consisted of 26 persons (45%) with a senior high school level, one person (2%) with diploma degree, and 31 persons (53%) with an undergraduate degree (S1).

4.4. Characteristic of respondents based on working experience

Employee characteristic based on the working experience of PT JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon is shown in figure 3.

Figure 3 shows that the respondents participating in this research consisted of six employees (10.3%) with 1-5 years working experience, four employees (6.9%) with 16-20 years working experience, 48 employees (82.8%) with working experience of more than 20 years. None of the employees has a working experience of 6-10 years and 11-15 years.

Based on output Coefficients in table 2, the following regression equation can be formulated:
Explanation:

1. Based on that equation, if motivation \((X_1)\) and job satisfaction \((X_2)\) are not present or zero, the value of organizational citizenship behavior \((Y)\) is 10,897.

2. The regression coefficient of motivation variable \((X_1)\) is 0.189 which means if the other variable remains constant and motivation \((X_1)\) increases by 1, the variable of organizational citizenship behavior \((Y)\) will increase by 0.189. The positive sign of this coefficient means that there is a positive relationship between motivation \((X_1)\) and organizational citizenship behavior \((Y)\). The higher the motivation \((X_2)\) is, the higher the organizational citizenship behavior becomes \((Y)\).

\[
Y = 10.897 + 0.189X_1 + 0.213X_2
\]

![Figure 3. Characteristics of Respondents Based on Working Period](image)

Based on output Model Summary in table 3, the value of adjusted R Square \((R^2)\) is 0.458, meaning that motivation \((X_1)\) and job satisfaction \((X_2)\) affect organizational citizenship behavior \((Y)\) by 45.8%. While the rest of 54.2% is affected by other variables outside this research.

The output Anova in table 4 shows that \(F_{\text{calculated}}\) value is 25.129 with sig value of 0.000 and \(F_{\text{table}}\) of 3.16. As the sig value is less than alpha 5% \((0.000 < 0.05)\) and \(F_{\text{calculated}}\) is larger than \(F_{\text{table}}\), \(H_0\) is rejected, and \(H_a\) is accepted. Therefore, it can be said that motivation and job satisfaction simultaneously affect organizational citizenship behavior.
Coefficients*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized</th>
<th>Standardized</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coefficients</td>
<td>Coefficients</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>10.897</td>
<td>2.158</td>
<td>.035</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>.189</td>
<td>.336</td>
<td>1.547</td>
<td>.128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction</td>
<td>.213</td>
<td>.374</td>
<td>1.725</td>
<td>.090</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: OCB

Source: SPSS 21.0 for Windows output

Table 3. Model Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>604.190</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>302.095</td>
<td>25.129</td>
<td>.000b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>661.207</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>12.022</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1265.397</td>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: OCB
b. Predictors: (Constant), Job Satisfaction, Motivation

4.5. Influence of Motivation on Organizational Citizenship Behavior of Employees

Based on the result of hypothesis testing, it can be shown that the value of sig is less than an alpha of 5% (0.000 < 0.05) and the calculated value is larger than Ftable (6.758 > 2.003). So, H0 is rejected, and Ha is accepted. Thus, it can be said that motivation positively and significantly affects organizational citizenship behavior.

This result is in line with Riantini and Iriawan (2016) stating that motivation has a positive and significant influence on organizational citizenship behavior at Revenue and Financial Management Office of Surabaya. Thus, it can be interpreted that the higher the motivation is, the higher the organizational citizenship behavior of employees becomes.

Based on the frequency distribution table, the lowest average score is found in the 13th statement regarding the respect of 3.88 and the highest average score is found in the 7th statement regarding the achievement of targets of 4.76. Thus, it can be stated that the indicator of respect in motivation variable (X1) is fair while the indicator of target achievement can be said to be very good in influencing organizational citizenship behavior (Y) of employees at PT JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon.
4.6. **Influence of Job Satisfaction on Organizational Citizenship Behavior of Employees**

Based on the result of hypothesis testing, it can be shown that the value of sig is less than an alpha of 5% (0.000 < 0.05) and \( t_{\text{calculated}} \) value of (6.834) is larger than \( F_{\text{table}} \). So, \( H_0 \) is rejected, and \( H_a \) is accepted. Thus, it can be said that job satisfaction affects organizational citizenship behavior.

This result supports Antonio and Susanto (2007) who stated that job satisfaction positively and significantly affects organizational citizenship behavior at CV Supratex. Thus, it can be said that the higher the job satisfaction is, the higher the organizational citizenship behavior of the employees at CV Supratex becomes.

Based on the frequency distribution table, the lowest average score is found in the 6th statement regarding the salary of 4.33 and the highest average score is found in the 11th statement regarding the job itself of 4.65. Thus, it can be stated that the indicators of salary and job in job satisfaction variable (X2) can be said to be very good in influencing organizational citizenship behavior (Y) of employees at PT JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon.

4.7. **Influence of Motivation and Job Satisfaction on Organizational Citizenship Behavior of Employees**

In this research, we found the R coefficient of 0.691 showing that the influence of motivation (X1) and job satisfaction (X2) on organizational citizenship behavior (Y) is strong. The determination coefficient or \( R^2 \) (Adjusted R Square) is 0.458 which means that motivation (X1) and job satisfaction (X2) affect organizational citizenship behavior (Y) variable by 45.8%. The rest of 54.2% in organizational citizenship behavior is affected by other variables outside this research. Based on hypothesis testing, it is found that sig. value is less than 0.05 (0.000 < 0.05) (this research uses alpha of 5%) and \( F_{\text{calculated}} \) value of 25.129 which is larger than \( F_{\text{table}} \) of 3.16. Therefore, \( H_0 \) is rejected and \( H_a \) is accepted, stating that motivation and job satisfaction simultaneously affect organizational citizenship behavior.

This result is in line with Susmiati and Jajuk (2017) who stated that motivation and job satisfaction positively and significantly affect organizational citizenship behavior with a determination coefficient (\( R^2 \)) of 0.949. Their research showed that 94.9% of OCB is influenced by job satisfaction and motivation of the employees.
5. Conclusion and Limitation

In this research, we conclude that:

1. Motivation, job satisfaction, and organizational citizenship behavior of employees at PT JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon are excellent.

2. Partially, motivation has a positive and significant effect on organizational citizenship behavior of employees at PT JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon. It means that if the motivation of employees increases, their organizational citizenship behavior will also increase.

3. Partially, job satisfaction has a positive and significant effect on organizational citizenship behavior of employees at PT JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon. It means that if the job satisfaction of employees increases, their organizational citizenship behavior will also increase.

4. Simultaneously, motivation and job satisfaction have a positive and significant effect on organizational citizenship behavior of employees at PT JasaMarga (Persero) Tbk. Palikanci Cirebon. It means, motivation and job satisfaction of employees simultaneously affect organizational citizenship behavior.

This research was carried out under the proper research procedure. Nonetheless, this study still has a limitation because the factors influencing organizational citizenship behavior that we studied only consist of two variables, namely motivation and job satisfaction. There are still many other factors that may influence organizational citizenship behavior which can be studied in further research.

References


Administrator, 27, 3–7.


https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2014.974340


An Investigation of Negative Reviews on TripAdvisor about the Seafood Restaurants in Kyrenia

Müjdat ERTÜRK
Dr., Eskişehir Tepebaşı Ali Güven Vocational and Technical Anatolian High School
mujdate26@gmail.com

Abstract
In this research, negative reviews written on tripadvisor.com about the seafood restaurants in Kyrenia were examined. The average of the ratings of the restaurants is 4.14 on a 5 point scale. This average indicates high satisfaction. Customers wrote 938 reviews about the restaurants. Of the customers who wrote these reviews, 62% rated their experience as excellent, 24% as very good, 7% as average, 3% as poor, and 4% as terrible. These ratings also indicate high satisfaction. Of all the reviews, 137 are negative. Of the customers who wrote these negative reviews, 3% rated their experience as excellent, 6% as very good, 45% as average, 18% as poor, and 29% as terrible. Of these negative reviews, 30% are about the dishes, 23% about the staff, 19% about the prices, 16% about the service, 6% about the service environment, and 6% about the menus.

Keywords: TRNC- Kyrenia, Seafood Restaurants, TripAdvisor, Negative Reviews, Complaints
An Investigation of Negative Reviews on Tripadvisor about the Seafood Restaurants in Kyrenia

Müjdat ERTÜRK
Dr., Eskişehir Tepebaşı Ali Güven Vocational and Technical Anatolian High School
mujdate26@gmail.com

Abstract

In this research, negative reviews written on tripadvisor.com about the seafood restaurants in Kyrenia were examined. The average of the ratings of the restaurants is 4.14 on a 5 point scale. This average indicates high satisfaction. Customers wrote 938 reviews about the restaurants. Of the customers who wrote these reviews, 62% rated their experience as excellent, 24% as very good 7% as average, 3% as poor, and 4% as terrible. These ratings also indicate high satisfaction. Of all the reviews, 137 are negative. Of the customers who wrote these negative reviews, 3% rated their experience as excellent, 6% as very good, 45% as average, 18% as poor, and 29% as terrible. Of these negative reviews, 30% are about the dishes, 23% about the staff, 19% about the prices, 16% about the service, 6% about the service environment, and 6% about the menus.

Keywords: TRNC- Kyrenia, Seafood Restaurants, TripAdvisor, Negative Reviews, Complaints

1. Introduction

Today, the internet is a phenomenon that provides the fastest communication and helps the development of technologies that can be applied in all areas. The internet offers various opportunities for service businesses to increase their number of customers and strengthen their communication with their existing customers. It is quite essential for customer relations management that businesses follow the social networks on the internet and respond to all the positive or negative comments about their businesses.

Today, customer experience has an important place for social and economic life (Quan and Wang, 2004). Customer experience is defined as the direct or indirect experience of customers about a company (Meyer and Schwager 2007). Customer loyalty, customer lifetime value and the establishment of a long-term relationship based on mutual trust between customers and
businesses are of paramount importance for businesses to achieve competitive advantage (Morgan and Hunt, 1994). A relationship based on mutual trust between customers and companies is directly related to customer satisfaction. Customer satisfaction indicates that customers’ expectations before consumption are met after their service experience (Westbrook, 1980).

Informal transfer of information about a product, service or business from a customer to another are defined as word of mouth marketing. Along with the diversification of websites on the internet, consumers have begun to use the internet to learn about the product they are considering buying or the business they are considering buying from. Thus, this concept, which is also referred to as the electronic word of mouth communication, has become widespread (Jeong and Jang 2011: 356-357). Some studies have reported that because consumers’ comments, opinions, and recommendations have become very important, nowadays, electronic word of mouth communication is effective on consumer purchase decisions (Sotiriadis and Van Zyl 2013; Bae and Lee 2011; Zeng and Gerritsen 2014).

Tripadvisor.com, one of the social networks on the internet, is one of the most important sites in terms of electronic word of mouth communication for businesses operating in all areas of tourism. tripadvisor.com, a website where anyone who has benefitted from the services of an enterprise can easily write reviews about and rate that enterprise, is nowadays highly effective in the purchase decision of many consumers. In this respect, reviews on this site, especially negative reviews may probably become very crucial for organizations.

2. Conceptual Framework and Literature Review

The behaviours of customers, whose expectations about a product or a service are not met or who feel dissatisfied, towards that service or the products of the organization are called consumer complaints (Singh and Pandya, 1991). Studies on consumer complaint behaviour can be classified under the following general headings: types of consumer complaint behaviours, causes of complaints, companies’ efforts to compensate for product and service errors, customer relationship management, and complaint management systems in organizations (Singh, 1988; Crie, 2003; Grougiou and Pettigrew, 2009; Dahl and Peltier, 2015). Research conducted to determine the reasons of consumer complaint behaviour showed that personal factors might result in complaints. These factors can be summarized as personality traits, demographic
characteristics, and attitudes towards complaints (Fornell and Westbrook, 1979; Jacoby and Jaccard, 1981; Singh, 1990). Consumer interaction styles, which are included in personal characteristics, are defined as consistent behaviour patterns that consumers exhibit to achieve the desired result regarding consumption behaviour (Richins, 1983). Consumer interaction styles are examined in two sub-categories: “self-assurance” and “aggressiveness” (Richins, 1987).

Dissatisfied consumers can file a direct or indirect complaint about an organization (Kim et al., 2003). It has been determined that consumers usually express their reactions in three different ways: to complain directly to the enterprise, to complain to other people and various consumer organizations, or to file complaints to the judiciary (Barlow and Moller 1998; DeFranco et al. 2005). According to Mattila and Wirtz (2004), customers can make a complaint face-to-face and by telephone, or they may prefer to complain by letter and e-mail. Electronic word of mouth communication (e-wom) can be defined as the sharing of positive or negative information, comments, and experiences related to products and businesses online by old, current or potential customers (Hennig-Thurau et al., 2004). Consumers have different levels of risk perception in all consumption behaviours, and reference groups are the important tool to reduce this risk perception (Hussain et al., 2017). In today’s consumption process, it is possible to say that the e-wom communication channels are highly effective at every stage from the information search stage to the purchase decision (Moore, 2015; Erkan and Evans, 2016; Chen et al., 2016; Hussain et al., 2018). According to the results of Nielsen’s (2015) research, sixty-nine per cent of consumers bases their purchasing decisions on online consumer reviews.

TripAdvisor is the world’s largest social network which is used by the tourism industry and enables online word of mouth communication. TripAdvisor also offers enterprises the opportunity to respond to reviews. Online comments posted by users provide information about tourism businesses for past and future customers (Sparks and Bradley, 2014). tripadvisor.com provides its users with the opportunity to create profiles and comment on their experiences about a product or an enterprise. Users can rate their experiences as 1=terrible, 2=poor, 3=average, 4=very good, 5=excellent, and write reviews about their experience. Businesses can respond to these comments and communicate directly with customers and potential customers. With tripadvisor.com, consumers can search faster and more widely, and they can access more information according to their preferences and interests (Raguseo, 2017: 746). In their study, Xiang and Gretzel (2010) concluded that TripAdvisor is the most frequently used website among other electronic e-wom websites.
3. Method

3.1. Purpose and Importance of the Research

The present study was conducted to examine the negative reviews on tripadvisor.com written by customers who visited the seafood restaurants in Kyrenia and thus help the restaurants create strategies for online complaint management. Kyrenia is the most important and most demanding region of TRNC in terms of Tourism. According to the figures 2018, the number of 25,241 beds in the TRNC is 16,077, in other words 64% of them are in Kyrenia. 62% of the accommodation companies in TRNC operate in Kyrenia. 62% of the accommodation establishments throughout the TRNC are operating in Kyrenia. The largest number of food and beverage companies across the TRNC are operating in the Kyrenia region. Since it is the locomotive region of TRNC tourism, Kyrenia Region has been selected for research. To achieve this aim, negative reviews about these restaurants on tripadvisor.com were identified and grouped. Thus, the restaurants can see the subject of the negative reviews and will be able to compensate for them.

3.2. Scope and Limitations

The scope of the study was limited to the seafood restaurants in Kyrenia; the seafood restaurants in other parts of Cyprus were not included in the study.

3.3. Population and Sample

The population of the study consists of seafood restaurants in Kyrenia. Since it is not possible to reach all the customers who visited all the restaurants in Kyrenia and get their opinions, 32 seafood restaurants, which were rated and about which reviews were written on tripadvisor.com, were included in the sample, and all the reviews about these restaurants were examined.

3.4. Data Collection and Analysis

On https://www.tripadvisor.com.tr/Restaurants-g190378-Kyrenia_Kyrenia_District.html seafood restaurants option was selected, and 938 reviews, written as of March 15, 2018, about 32 seafood restaurants were reached, and it was determined that 137 of all the reviews were negative. Later, these 137 negative reviews were analysed through content analysis. As a result of the analysis, the negative reviews were categorized into six categories including 16 subjects of complaint.
4. Findings

Until March 15, 2018, users had written reviews about 32 seafood restaurants in Kyrenia. All of these 32 restaurants were rated by the users. Of these restaurants, only one responded to the users. This restaurant responded to 106 of 141 reviews written about it.

Table 1. Average of Customers’ Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>4,14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price</td>
<td>4,06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dishes</td>
<td>4,14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atmosphere</td>
<td>4,20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>4,14</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 presents the averages of the ratings of 32 seafood restaurants in Kyrenia. The table indicates that the customers felt most satisfied with the atmosphere where they felt least satisfied with the price. The average of the ratings of all the dimensions is 4.14 on a 5 point scale.

Table 2. Distribution of Reviews by Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Number of Reviews</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td>585</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very Good</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrible</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>938</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 presents the distribution of the number of reviews by customers’ ratings. The table indicates that of all the customers who wrote the reviews about the restaurants, 62% rated them as excellent, 24% as very good, 7% as average, 3% as poor, and 4% as terrible. These figures indicate that 86% of customers are satisfied with the service they received.

Table 3. Distribution of Negative Reviews by Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Number of Reviews</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very Good</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrible</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>137</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 3 presents the distribution of negative reviews by ratings. The table indicates that of the customers who wrote these comments, 45% rated these restaurants as average whereas 3% rated them as excellent. All of the ‘poor’ or ‘terrible’ ratings are also together with negative reviews.

All of the customers who rated the restaurants as excellent (4) complained about the prices. Two of these negative reviews are as follows:

“The dishes were quite tasty, and everything was very good, but the prices were high.”

“The dishes and the side orders were wonderful; it would have been perfect had the prices been a bit lower.”

Of the customers who rated the restaurants as very good (8), three complained about the prices, four about the service-related problems, and one about the service environment. Four of these negative reviews are as follows:

“Everything was nice but extremely expensive.”

“Excellent location and pretty good service. But it is a bit expensive compared to similar restaurants.”

“The restaurant has a wonderful view; the menu and flavours are delicious, but the service is not so successful.”

“The dishes, service, ambience were very nice, but we had to get out for fresh air as they allowed customers to smoke inside.”

Table 4. Distribution of Negative Reviews by Category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Negative reviews about the Dishes</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooking Mistakes</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taste of Dishes</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small Size of Portions</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Categories</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Negative reviews about the Staff</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unresponsive Staff</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclean Staff</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rude Staff</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Staff</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discrimination of Customers</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Categories</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Negative reviews about the Prices</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expensive</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Categories</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Negative reviews about the Service</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4 presents the distribution of negative reviews by category. The table indicates that the customers mostly complained about the dishes (42 negative reviews- 30%). The negative reviews about the dishes are mainly about the taste of the dishes (20 negative reviews- 48%). Other negative reviews about the dishes are about cooking mistakes (19 negative reviews- 45%) and the small size of portions (3 negative reviews- 7%). Five of these negative reviews are as follows:

“The dishes couldn’t be any worse. There is no service quality of Istanbul’s worst places on an island like Cyprus.”

“I ordered the fixed menu. Nothing was edible other than the salad and artichoke. The hot appetizers were overcooked. The calamari was like rubber.”

“Half of those written on the menu did not show up, and those who were brought were in ‘stingy’ portions. Don’t waste your time and money!”

“Not so bad, but the amounts of appetizers are quite low and the flavour is average; due to its location in the port, prices are slightly higher than in other parts of Cyprus.”

“Well done meat for them is the meat that should be eaten starting from the middle; I could not even eat it, at least the cats were happy.”

Also, the table indicates that the category with the second most negative reviews about is the staff category (31 negative reviews- 23%). These negative reviews are mostly about ‘rude staff’ and ‘discrimination of customers’ (9 negative reviews each- 29%). Other negative reviews about the staff are about ‘unresponsive staff’ (8 negative reviews- 26%), ‘the quality of the staff’ (4 negative
reviews- 15%), and unclean staff (1 negative review- 3%). Five of these negative reviews are as follows:

“The location and the dishes were quite successful, but the unresponsive staff made us sad. We sat at our table, and after 15 minutes, they served one plate of olives and some bread. Then, we were about to change our opinions when they started to bring the side orders, but we had to ask four times for more bread, two times for coffee, and three times for the check. I hope responsible friends will take our warning into account.”

“I don’t know whether it was because we were the only table in the restaurant, but I had to stand up three times to go and get a clean glass. What is even more interesting was that when another table came, the rude man in a blue shirt who was called the “chief” (headwaiter) came to our table and scolded us for standing up or talking. It was quite shocking and offending.”

“Mr. Waiter (!) said that he could not serve us the dishes we ordered because we should buy at least three sets of menus (?) because these tables are worth at least 400 TL. We said that we could not eat so much food with two children three and nine years of age and that we wanted to talk to the boss. It turns out this was the order of the boss, and they didn’t even let us talk to the boss.”

“The restaurant was on the seafront, and the quality of the dishes was above the average. However, we said that we would not drink alcohol; the attitude of the headwaiter towards us was so annoying that we will never eat there even if the food was free and offered on a golden tray. Not every customer in a seafood restaurant has to drink alcohol.”

“Pakistani and African inexperienced waiters, tasteless appetizers and overcooked fish, high prices, and the rude management will ruin your night. Stay away!”

The category with the third highest number of negative reviews according to the table is the price category (26 negative reviews- 19%). Three of these negative reviews are as follows:

“Frozen seafood is served in an amateur manner. You can’t satisfy your hunger, and most importantly the prices are very high.”

“The dishes and service had fast food quality, but they were still too expensive. One piece of cheese wedge was 10 TL. Octopus was served in 3 pieces with a price of 55 TL. There are much more quality venues in the harbour at much more affordable prices.”

“Very very expensive; the worst ink fish I have ever eaten in my life; It was disgusting; I do not recommend this restaurant to anyone if you don’t want to waste your money.”
The category with the fourth highest number of negative reviews according to the table is the service category (22 negative reviews- 16%). These negative reviews are mostly about ‘poor service’ (14 negative reviews, 64%) and ‘slow service’ (8 negative reviews- 36%). Three of these negative reviews are as follows:

“The restaurant has a nice view, but the service is very unsuccessful. Although there were only 2-3 tables, the waiters were unresponsive. The taste of the dishes is not bad but ordinary.”

“Bad appetizers, poor service! If a waiter is new, he should get full training. Do the service properly. If four waiters cannot deal with three tables and customers wait for water for minutes, you must close the restaurant.”

“It was a big disappointment. Service sucks. Plates, forks, knives ... They don’t know how to serve. The tablecloth wasn’t even clean. We waited for 5 minutes for a waiter. And it was not cheap.”

The category with the fifth highest number of negative reviews according to the table is the service environment category (8 negative reviews- 6%). These negative reviews are mostly about insufficient cleaning (4 negative reviews, 50%), noise (2 negative reviews, 25%), insufficient technology (1 negative review, 12.5%), and insufficient equipment (1 negative review, 12.5%). Three of these negative reviews are as follows:

“We were not satisfied with neither the dishes, nor service, nor hygiene. Prices were higher than should be; we tried the restaurant for once but will never go there again. Apparently, one should not eat seafood in the Port of Kyrenia in the near future.”

“It is like a fast food restaurant with noise and abundant smoke. I didn’t know that the grilled octopus was an octopus; it scattered like thick cheese. I do not recommend anyone.”

“I went there at night on the 1st of February. They served the main course 2 hours late. To make us leave the restaurant after 11 pm, they closed the electric heaters (saying that there was a problem) and said that the wireless had a problem.”

The category with the least number of negative reviews according to the table is the insufficient menu category (8 negative reviews- 6%). Three of these negative reviews are as follows:

“Excellent location and good service. But the menu was rather boring.”

“If the menu doesn’t contain something you order, the waiters should tell that it does not. When you ask a waiter something in that restaurant, the waiter does not come back to answer you.”
“The dishes were delicious, and there were plenty of choices, but there were not as many wine options. We had to drink the wine we did not like.”

5. Discussion and Conclusion

5.1. Theoretical implications

The Internet has now become a tool that affects consumer behavior and purchasing decision beyond communication and access to information. In terms of businesses operating in the service sector, the Internet offers many opportunities and applications to find new customers and to strengthen their relations with existing customers. Nowadays, it is common for consumers to make decisions by examining the comments and recommendations made on the internet about the product or service they are considering to make before making a purchase decision. In other words, consumers make the final purchase decision after their research on the internet. Therefore, the evaluations made by the users of the product or service via social networks are extremely important for businesses. The responses to these evaluations, as well as the evaluations, are closely monitored by potential customers, in particular the manner of communication against dissatisfied customers who have a negative opinion.

The “tripadvisor.com”, one of the social networks on the internet, is one of the most critical websites for businesses operating in all areas of tourism. The “tripadvisor.com” provides its users with the opportunity to review and rate businesses’ services and is therefore highly effective today in purchasing decision of many consumers. In this respect, reviews on this site, especially negative reviews, are essential for businesses.

In this research, negative reviews written on tripadvisor.com about the seafood restaurants in Kyrenia were examined. The average of the rating of the restaurants is 4.14 on a 5 point scale. This average indicates high satisfaction. Customers wrote 938 reviews about the restaurants. Of the customers who wrote these reviews, 585 (62%) rated their experience as excellent, 223 (24%) as very good, 66 (7%) as average, 24 (3%) as poor, and 40 (4%) as terrible. These ratings also indicate high satisfaction.

On the other hand, of all the reviews, 137 are negative. Of the customers who wrote these negative reviews, 4 (3%) rated their experience as excellent, 8 (6%) as very good, 61 (45%) as average, 24 (18%) as poor, and 40 (29%) as terrible.
Furthermore, of these negative reviews, 42 (30%) are about the dishes, 31 (23%) about the staff, 26 (19%) about the prices, 22 (16%) about the service, 8 (6%) about the service environment, and 8 (6%) about the menus.

5.2. Practical implications

Considering that the negative reviews are mostly about cooking mistakes and the taste of the dishes, it can be understood that the negative reviews are essentially about the staff. With more qualified staff and adequate audits, the number of these negative reviews can be reduced. Also, the high percentage of negative reviews about the staff (23%) indicates the necessity for the employment of more qualified staff. Considering that the percentage of total negative reviews in the two dimensions is 53%, we can argue that approximately half of the negative reviews will be prevented when the quality of the staff is increased. An effective audit of high prices and small sizes of portions will also prevent negative reviews about the prices and portions. Furthermore, qualified staff will use the cooking materials more efficiently, which, in turn, will probably lead to a reduction in costs. Poor and slow service is also one of the negative reviews related to the qualifications of the staff. These negative reviews can also be prevented by employing a sufficient number of qualified staff. Negative reviews such as ‘insufficient technology or equipment’ can be prevented through adequate investment in the service environment. Negative reviews about the hygiene of the restaurants can be prevented through effective audits. Also, negative reviews about ‘insufficient menus’ can be prevented by adding various dishes to the menus. Overall, the majority of negative reviews will be prevented through the employment of qualified staff.

6. Limitations and directions for future research:

This research only included sea food restaurants appearing in tripadvisor.com in Kyrenia, North Cyprus. Thus, the findings are limited to this destination. Sea food restaurants in other cities or destinations can differ from the studied enterprises due to dissimilarities in market competitiveness, and political conditions. Hence, further explorations may concentrate on other settings or comparative examination.

7. References


An Analysis of Factors Influencing Income of Households Producing Lychee Bearing Geographical Indications in Vietnam

Dr. Nguyen Quang Hau
Hoa Binh University, Viet Nam

Dr. Le Thi Yen
Thai Nguyen University of Economics and Business Administration, Vietnam
lethiynktdd@gmail.com

Abstract
This study was conducted to analyze the factors influencing the income of households producing products bearing geographical indications in Vietnam. Data for the study were collected from a survey of 188 households growing lychee bearing geographical indications in Vietnam. Using OLS regression model to analyze the influence level of factors. Research findings show that, the number of household labor, selling price, investment capital ...Factors affecting the income of households producing lychee products bearing geographical indications in Vietnam. Research findings are used as a basis for proposing recommendations to improve the income of households producing lychee with geographical indications in Vietnam.

Keywords: Income, production households, lychee, GIs.
An Analysis of Factors Influencing Income of Households Producing Lychee Bearing Geographical Indications in Vietnam

Dr. Nguyen Quang Hau
Hoa Binh University, Viet Nam

Dr. Le Thi Yen
Thai Nguyen University of Economics and Business Administration, Vietnam
lethiyenkttdt@gmail.com

Abstract
This study was conducted to analyze the factors influencing the income of households producing products bearing geographical indications in Vietnam. Data for the study were collected from a survey of 188 households growing lychee bearing geographical indications in Vietnam. Using OLS regression model to analyze the influence level of factors. Research findings show that, the number of household labor, selling price, investment capital ....Factors affecting the income of households producing lychee products bearing geographical indications in Vietnam. Research findings are used as a basis for proposing recommendations to improve the income of households producing lychee with geographical indications in Vietnam.

Keywords: Income, production households, lychee, GIs.
1. Introduction

Vietnam is a country which has a agriculture commodities diversity and to be favoured by nature with the development of products along with the quality of products, it has contributed to promoting the general economic development of Vietnam.

However, besides the achievements, agriculture still exists and limited: the forms of organization of production is slow to reform; agricultural production in many places is still fragmented, lack of links; rural environmental pollution in many places is still serious; life of a part of people, especially in remote areas still difficult; food safety and hygiene is still a pressing issue; unsustainable agricultural and rural industries, difficulties in the context of international economic integration.

In that context, agricultural development orientation needs to take into account the appropriate access strategies, focusing on two main development axes: 1) production and market access for agricultural products in large numbers and popularity, applied science and technology, advantages in large-scale goods producing; 2) produce and access markets with traditional, specialty products, quality and high added value based on regional advantages, cultural traditions and the accumulation of skills of the people. Along with each orientation are different solutions that can promote commercial development, use appropriate measures for the protection of intellectual property to support the sustainable development of agricultural commodities.

Vietnam has focused on developing strategic product bearing the geographical indication as a solution to build a brand for agricultural products, improve the value and effectiveness of agricultural production, as of December 30, 2016, Vietnam has protected 48 geographical indications, including 4 geographical indications of foreign countries and 44 geographical indications of Vietnam.

Lychee bearing geographical indications is one of Vietnam's typical agricultural products, local people have the main source of income from this tree. Therefore, how to develop this product to increase the income of people is a question that must be solved not only by policy makers, researchers but also the research object is the producer of these products. Therefore, this study was conducted to analyze the factors influencing income of households producing lychee bearing geographical indications in Vietnam.
2. Overview of research

The influencing of factors on income of households has been approached under different view, specifically:

Dominique Barjolle et al (2009) focused on methods to assess the impact of territorial geographical indications (economic, social and environmental), the results show that economic benefits are is the only engine in implementing product protection projects with geographical indications. The results show that these economic benefits is only purpose in implementing product protection projects with geographical indications.

Or in view of the Carina Folkeson (2005) the authors consider the economic impact of the geographical indication to object is the manufacturer. The research findings also show that the production of products bearing geographical indications in the EU has in many cases contributed to rural development, although the development is different between regions and different products. The study also concluded that statutory protection is necessary for benefits arising from the production geographical indications to benefit producers and related actors. The research results show that Basmati rice is more profitable than other crops, after that, the author studies the factors affecting the decision to produce products bearing geographical indications, one of the number of factors mentioned is the ability to access policies and the number of workers in the household.

Pradyot R. Jena, Ulrike Grote, (2010) used data from a survey of 300 rice farmers in a province of northern Indian namely Uttarakhand. In the study, the author analyzes the total profit, determines the net benefits of Basmati rice bearing geographic indications with other plants in the same locality but does not have a production certificate with specific geographical indications. The author chooses crop that do not have geographic indications certification as sugarcane. Simultaneously, the author has used the marginal benefit analysis method as a basis for conducting this research, straight line regression (OLS) used by the author to analyze the impact of geographical indications.

Le Dinh Thang (1993), Nguyen Sinh Cuc (2001) in their research, there were opinions about production households, each study has different specific views about production households, but in common, it is agreed that production households are units which participate in the production
of mining activities, processing products related to agriculture.

Some other studies conducted to determine the factors affecting the income of households in specific areas, in different localities such as: Nguyen Quoc Nghi et al (2011), Nguyen Van Thieu et al (2011), Nguyen Van Toan et al (2012), Huynh Thi Dan Xuan (2012), Nguyen Thi Hong Hanh et al (2013) ... Primary data is also selected by the authors for their research, this is also the most obvious similarity to the studies related to considering factors affecting household incomes, specifically here are the farm households agricultural production studied by the authors. The purpose of the studies: to determine the average income of households, and the factors affecting household income, the relationship between them. With the data collected, the author conducted the analysis using descriptive modeling and statistical methods, the models used were OLS models, this is a model which is relatively popular with research in Vietnam regarding factors affecting household's income in different fields

3. Research Methodology

3.1. Data collection methods

Data information serves for statistical analysis in this chapter was collected from the research team interviewed households by using standardized questionnaires.

Time for survey: From January 2018 to the end of May 2018.

+) Number of samples:

There are many different concepts about the sample, according to Hoelter (1983), the critical sample size must be 200. Nunnally and Burnstein (1994) suggest that with the Maximum Likelihood (ML) estimation method, the sample size must be at least 100-150.

From Nguyen Van Thang's point of view (2014), the minimum number of samples that can perform statistical operations is 100.

Accordingly, the authors conducted a survey after cleaning ensures data and minimum number of samples collected to perform statistical calculations of 100 observations for the study.

The author conducted a survey with 300 representatives of households. After collecting survey questionnaires, input data into excel software, the author removes the survey forms that do not meet
the requirements of data for the research, retains the completed questionnaires to request information to perform statistical analysis. 188 surveys were clean and meet the performance requirements of statistical analysis, the authors used observations performed 188 analyzes for the study, number of observations meet the requirements for the minimum number of observations to study the implementation of statistical analysis.

3.2. Data analysis methods

Data after being collected will be imported into excel software, then with the help of SPSS20.0 software, the author performs OLS regression to analyze the influence level of factors to the income of households producing lychee products bearing geographical indications.

4.2.2. Analyzing the influence of some factors on the income of households producing Litchi products bearing geographical indications

The author regresses the model to assess the influence of some factors on the income of households producing lychee products bearing geographical indications as follows:

*) Check the relevance of the model

With the proposed research model, the author conducts the verification of the appropriateness of regression form and some model defects.

Specific test results:

*Table 1: Results of conformity testing and some model defects*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
<th>Change Statistics</th>
<th>Durbin-Watson</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>R Square Change</td>
<td>F Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.886a</td>
<td>.785</td>
<td>.780</td>
<td>46.284</td>
<td>.785</td>
<td>166.792</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Chi_phi, Hoc_van, SL_LD, Gia_ban

b. Dependent Variable: Thu_nhap

*Source: Analysis results from the author's research data*
With R Square coefficient = 0.785 indicates that the independent variables in the model explain 78.5% of the dependent variable.

The test results show that the author model is relatively good when there is no defect in autocorrelation in the model, and the independent variables explain 78.5% of the dependent variable.

**Table 2: Results of conformity testing and some model defects**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>1429238.675</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>357309.669</td>
<td>166.792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>392032.198</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>2142.252</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1821270.872</td>
<td>187</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: Thu_nhapesition
b. Predictors: (Constant), Chi PHI, Hoc_van, SL_LD, Gia_ban

Source: Analysis results from the author's research data

Results from table 2 show:

+) With Sig coefficient = 0.000; test F = 166,792, so the research linear regression model is appropriate.

From data collected through the interview process ..., combined with the help of SPSS 20.0 software. The author uses the least squares method to consider the influence of factors on the income of households producing lychee products bearing geographical indications:

**Table 3: Results of Regression model**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>88.158</td>
<td>15.158</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.816</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoc_van</td>
<td>-2.454</td>
<td>1.131</td>
<td>-.075</td>
<td>-2.170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SL_LD</td>
<td>9.880</td>
<td>1.099</td>
<td>.362</td>
<td>8.992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gia_ban</td>
<td>6.153</td>
<td>.940</td>
<td>.495</td>
<td>6.548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quy_mo_von</td>
<td>.209</td>
<td>.094</td>
<td>.163</td>
<td>2.215</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: Thu_nhapk

Source: Analysis results from the author’s research data

Through the table results in the factors,

Group of factors affecting the same direction to income include: number of workers in the household, selling price and investment capital. In which, the factor of number of employees in households seems to affect most on average income of households with a coefficient of 9.880. Group of factors negative effect to the average income: the education level of the household head, the coefficient of this variable is negative. Specifically, how each of these factors affect the average income of households producing lychee products analyzed by the author below:

+) Number of workers in the household:

The factor of number of household workers positively affects the income of households producing lychee products, the coefficient of this variable is 9.880 with 99% significance level (sig. = 0.001 <0.01). Specifically, when the number of workers in the household increases by 1, the average income of households producing lychee products increases by 9.880% (according to the standardized beta coefficient).

This result is consistent with the viewpoint: Under less mechanized production conditions, the number of employees will be a key factor to increase household income of Abdulai&CroleRees, 2001; Yang, 2004. For producing lychee products is an agricultural product, labor is an essential element because the steps from care to collection need to be used for labor such as: pruning trees when the season ends clean the leaves, soil improvement, clean the weeds under the trees and collecting the entire crop residues on the focal point for limiting pest refuges, ... Therefore, a lot of workers will help create better care for the garden, improve the productivity of lychee.

+) Price:

Research results show that the selling price factor positively affects the income of households producing lychee products, the coefficient of this variable is 6.153 with a 99% significance level (sig.
Specifically, when the price increases by 1, the average income of households producing lychee products increases 6.153% (according to the standardized beta coefficient).

The selling price of products relatively large impact to household income producing products with geographical indications, if the price is not stable, At the beginning and at the end of crop, the price is high, at the main crop the lychee ’s price is low, the price difference between Luc Ngan lychee area with other districts in the province or with other provinces does not lead to insecure income for farmers.

+) Investment capital:

The factor of investment capital has the same impact to the income of households producing lychee products, the coefficient of this variable is 0.209 at the 95% significance level (sig. = 0.028 <0.01). Specifically, when the investment capital of households increases by 1, the average income of households producing lychee products increases by 0.209% (according to the standardized beta coefficient).

One of the important factors in production and business is a must stable capital, capital needed for new technology application, fertilizer purchase as well as labor cost ... When lychee products are bought by customers and the demand increases, business households tend to improve or expand their land, however, for this product, it requires long-term investment to improve the quality as well as productivity,

Because this is a seasonal product, only once a year, so to invest in renovating or growing it takes a lot of time and effort. Investment capital can be obtained from equity or credit.

However, the equity of the households is only enough to cover a part of the costs, the remaining investment capital is mainly borrowed from credit, so the loan is very important for the households. When households are supported with good loans, business households have capital to invest in machinery, technology, expand production, income will increase. This result is consistent with the research of Huynh Thi Dan Xuan and Mai Van Nam (2011), Nguyen Quoc Nghi et al (2011).

+) Education level:

The research results show that the educational level has a negative impact on the income of households producing lychee products, the coefficient of this variable is -2.454 with the significance level of 95% (sig. = 0.031 <0.01) . Specifically, when the education level increased
by 1, the average income of households producing lychee products decreased 0.424% (according to the standardized beta coefficient)

This result is the opposite with the views of Foster & Rosenzweig, 1996; Pitt & Sumodiningrat, 1991; Yang, 2004: education determines the advantages of each person in creating income by high education that is receptive, apply new techniques to production and efficient use of other resources. Besides, education also enhances the ability to capture and process market information to create opportunities to participate in non-farm activities, thereby increasing income. And also does not support the views of author Nguyen Quoc Nghi et al (2011). The education level of the household head is positively related to household income, meaning that the higher the education level, the more income the people have

However, as analyzed, lychee products are agricultural products and have been on the market for many years, not a new product. It is also a reason that the education level has no positive impact on income. The most important agricultural work is experience, "experience is better than cleverness", especially with lychee fruit, farmers need to have practical knowledge to deal with plant diseases, which season should fertilize fertilizer, which period should spray pesticides and growth regulators suitable for lychee...High level of education, a lot of knowledge but rarely practice, rarely working when embarking on to practice is embarrassing, inexperienced leading to failure.

5. Recommendations

To increase the income of lychee farmers bearing geographical indications in Vietnam, some proposed solutions are as follows:

Training courses on processing and preserving lychee products need to be organized from which can choose a wider range of product consumption methods more diverse for producers.

Training for households producing/ farmers who growing agricultural products about market development skills

When skilled in market development and exposure to customer needs for products, producers will know what customer requirements about their products and will adjust to suit the tastes and meet
market demand: including in both quality as well as requirements when packaging and harvesting products.

Strengthening support from competent state agencies to support people in credit loans, market access, rational use of resources in production and business of households, lychee growers to avoid input resource wasting

6. References
Carina Folkeson, (2005), Geographical Indications and Rural Development in the EU, school of economics and management, Lund University
Dominique Barjolle, Marguerite Paus, Anna Perret, (2009), Impacts of Geographical Indications Review of Methods and Empirical Evidence, International Association of Agricultural Economists Conference, Beijing, China
Huynh Thi Dan Xuan and colleagues, (2011), Analysis of factors affecting the income of poultry farms in the Mekong Delta, Science Magazine - Can Tho University
Hoang Trong and Chu Nguyen Mong Ngoc, (2008), Statistics in socio-economy, Statistical Publishing House
Le Dinh Thang , (1993), Household economic development toward commodity production, Agricultural Publishing House, Hanoi
Nguyen Thi Hong Hanh and colleagues, (2013), the impact of withdrawing agricultural land on lives of farmers in Van Lam district, Hung Yen province. Scientific journals and development No. 1, episode 11
Nguyen Van Thang, (2014), research practices in economics and business administration course, National Economics University Publishing House
Nguyen Quoc Nghi et al, (2011), Factors affecting income of ethnic minorities in the Mekong Delta, scientific journals vol 18


Pradyot R. Jena, Ulrike Grot, (2010), does geographical indication (GI) increase producer welfare? A case study of Basmati rice in Northern India, the ISEE conference

Vu Thi Minh , (2004), Developing fruit trees in mountainous areas of Quang Ninh province, National Economic University

Nguyen Van Toan , (2012), Effects of P135 programs on the livelihoods of ethnic minorities in Huong Hoa district, Quang Tri province, science - magazine Hue University 3 episode number 72B.